A test for evaluating wine judge performance is developed. The test is based on the premise that an expert wine judge will award similar scores to an identical wine. The definition of similar is parameterized to include varying number of adjacent awards on an ordinal scale, No-Award to Gold. For each index of similarity an empirically derived probability distribution is developed to determine the likelihood that a judge might pass the test by chance alone. When the test is applied to the results from a major wine competition, few judges pass the test. Of greater interest is that many judges who fail the test have vast professional experience in the wine industry. This leads to us to question the basic premise, that experts are able to provide consistent evaluations in wine competitions, and hence, that wine competitions yield unpredictable results.