

**An Examination of Judge Reliability at a major U.S. Wine Competition  
Part 1. Experimental Design, Implementation Details and Interpretation of  
Results**

Robert T. Hodgson  
Professor emeritus, Humboldt State University  
Arcata California  
bob@fieldbrookwinery.com

**Abstract**

An experimental design employing replicate sampling to evaluate the integrity of wine competitions is discussed to answer the question, "why do wines win gold medals at some competitions and fail to place in others?" As well as standard statistical measures, an inconsistency-index is proposed to isolate a particular judge's role in panel incoherence. Analysis-of-variance methods are described and interpreted. Examples of actual judge scores are presented.