

## Vienna 2019 Abstract Submission

### Title

Why the Judgment in Paris cannot be replicated today specifically with Burgundy and New World Pinot Noir with a focus on Oregon.

### I want to submit an abstract for:

Conference Presentation

### Corresponding Author

Gregory Whitten

### E-Mail

[ghwhitten@gmail.com](mailto:ghwhitten@gmail.com)

### Affiliation

Les Climats Imports

### Keywords

Pinot Noir, Burgundy, Oregon, Limestone, Jory, Business

### Research Question

Can the Judgment of Paris be replicated with a focus on Burgundy and New World Pinot Noir?

### Methods

Focus of my research will be one of business looking at wine market sales trends in the 1970's compared to the global market of today.

### Results

TBD

### Abstract

THE FULL ABSTRACT WITH CITATIONS IS ATTACHED

Why the Judgment in Paris cannot be replicated today specifically with Burgundy and New World Pinot Noir with a focus on Oregon.

Research Question

Can the Judgment of Paris be replicated with a focus on Burgundy and New World Pinot Noir?

Key Words

Pinot Noir, Burgundy, Oregon, Limestone, Jory, Business

Intro and Proposed Research

Recently there has been some speculation as to having another "1976 Judgment in Paris" tasting where you comparing the historical region of Red Burgundy with new world Pinot Noir. This actually was done in the most recent movie SOMM 3, but I will advocate with my research why this is not apples to apples as with California Bordeaux Blends and Bordeaux Cru Classified wines were in the 1976 tasting hosted by Steven Spurrier. Through my research I will look at the historical classification of Burgundy compared to Bordeaux and the differences. I will also use the example of Oregon as the most established Pinot Noir growing region in the new world for the purpose of this presentation. I will compare Oregon, Bordeaux, Napa and Burgundies history and show how different they

are and why it would not work in a world-class competition. Then I will look at the scientific soil composition of Burgundies famous “limestone” compared to the “jory” clay of the Willamette Valley to show how different it affects the varietal so that it could not be compared. I will also address why Red Burgundy is different from White Burgundy, which was included in the 1976 tasting from the aspect of the difference of Chardonnay and Pinot Noir. Finally I will look at how the 1976 Judgment in Paris changed the business of wine and helped open a whole new market for wine. I will look at the years following the tasting and the up tick in new world wine market and then compare that too the Willamette Valley market in the last decade to show that there is no need for a tasting like this today.

#### Research Method

The main focus of my research will be one of business looking at wine market sales trends in the 1970’s compared to the global market of today. This will overlap with the scientific and historical aspects of Burgundy, Oregon’s Willamette Valley and Napa Valley, which will show that the current business climate backed by science and history shows that you cannot recreate the 1976 Judgment of Paris.

#### Burgundy Classifications

To understand why the Judgment of Paris will not be replicated between Burgundy and New World Pinot Noir you have to understand the classification and history of Burgundy. There are currently four modern classifications for Burgundy wine; they are as followed Bourgogne (region wide), Village (44 Village classifications), Premier Cru (641 vineyards) and Grand Cru (33 vineyards). This system is classified under French law called Appellations d’Origine Contrôlée or AOC for short and Burgundy is composed of 100 AOC’s. The law provides strict guidelines for from harvesting to how to treat the vineyards it also provides authentication for the consumer. In production regional wines produce 51.7% of total production, Village 36.8%, Premier Cru’s 10.1%, and Grand Cru’s 1.4%. The modern day AOC was passed on July 30, 1935.

This was pre-dated in burgundy by many strict regulations set since the roman times, due to the global respect that Burgundian wine has had in history. In 1395 Gamay was outlawed in the vineyards of Phillippe le Hardi. On November 13th 1131 Hughes II Duke of Burgundy ceded all of the forest and land around the monetary of St Vivant and that was the beginning of cultivation in Burgundy (today known as the vineyard of Romanee St Vivant). The monk used a sharecropping style system to contract grape growers and wine makers for the order. Some experts think that the use of provenage throughout the pre-modern times where one cuts a health vine in half spreads it out and bury the two vines to grow young vines cultivated the Pinot Noir grape for the world in Burgundy. Revolution the regulations were mainly driven by landowners and royalty out of respect. but after the French Revolution it was mainly out of trade. One of the most renowned classifications came from a Burgundian wine trade leader names Andre Julien. He broke burgundy wines into categories to be sold and they went as followed.

#### TABLE ATTACHED

From there came Dr. Denis Morelot who meticulously went through each climat in the Cote d’Or and found that at the top and middle of the famous hill the soil was marl and the famous limestone in turn setting the standard for the modern AOC of premier and grand cru vineyard designations. Though the biggest and most influential person who laid the ground work for the detailed and meticulous modern day burgundy AOC was Dr. Jules Lavell his work was the basis for the first modern classification under the Comte d’Agriculture de Beaune (Beaune Agriculture Committee) of 1860. His work was all Historie et statistique de la vigne et des grand vine de la Cote-d’Or (History and Statistics of the Vine and the Great Wines of Cote d’Or). In this work he goes into detail about each vineyard in the Cote d’Or and describes the production numbers, soil and also the wines it produces. He broke these wines up into the categories below, which were the predecessor of the current AOC guidelines, though not exact. For example his top classification Tetes de Cuvees are fewer in numbers than the current Grand Cru’s. He also adds an extra classification in places for very excellent wines call “vin extra.” The Classification are below and I try to align them as close as I can with the current AOC classifications.

#### TABLE ATTACHED

#### Bordeaux Classification

The Bordeaux classification was established per the request of Napoleon at the Exposition Universelle in 1855. The

Bordeaux Chamber of commerce took the lead in establishing the class, which is made up of first through fifth growth. There was a revision in 1973, which included Mouton Rothschild into the first growth category. The classification system was very much based on commerce and not where the chateaus are actually situated. This is drastically different than Burgundy, which is based as above on scientific reasoning and taste of each Climat. What this produces is drastically different wines that cannot be put into one category. In my research I plan to dive deeper into how these classifications work, and how the Bordeaux classification sets up better in a head to head competition as with the 1976 Judgment in Paris.

#### Oregon Willamette Valley vs. Napa Valley History

Fine wine in the Willamette Valley dates back to between 1965 and 1968 when three UC Davis graduates David Lett, Charles Coury and Dick Erath all separately came to the valley to grow cool climate varietals. Others soon followed they planted Pinot Noir, Riesling, Chardonnay and Pinot Gris. They worked together to try to identify sites that would be ideal for these varietals. As you can see the Willamette Valley and other regions that soon followed in the United States are much younger than Napa Valley where most of the red wines came from in the 1976 Judgment of Paris. The first mission grapes in Napa and Sonoma were planted in the mid 1800's and from there a booming industry was born until prohibition. Though a lot of the wineries in the tasting were up and coming there was a long lineage of growing grapes in Napa and Sonoma giving them a much more established industry to go against Bordeaux in the tasting. I will dive deeper into this topic and point out the difference between the two regions.

#### Soil Composition

One of the drastic differences is in the soil composition between Burgundy and the Willamette Valley. It is well known that Pinot Noir more than any other grape is very fical (thin skinned) and takes on characters from its terroir. While Bordeaux varietals and Chardonnay tend to be more of a blank slate and allows wine makers to put their personal touch on the finished wine. In Burgundy the soil can drastically change from vineyard to vineyard and that is the difficulty as mentioned before in putting these wines in a head to head category. The two major types are Jurassic Limestone and Marl which is a mix of Clay and Limestone. These soil types are drastically different than the Willamette Valley, which is mainly composed of the famous "Jory" soil, which is the Volcanic Basalt from the Missoula Flood millions of years ago. There is some marine sediment mixed in as well. There is virtually no limestone in the Willamette Valley. This in conjunction to Pinot Noir being affected so much by Terroir produces to different types of wine which I feel you cannot put into competition to get a true verdict of who makes better Pinot Noir, because they are two different types of wine.

#### White Burgundy vs. Red Burgundy

The last area I will look at is the difference between White and Red Burgundy since White Burgundy was included in the first Judgment of Paris as the White Wine vs. California Chardonnay. In this section of the presentation I will point out how Chardonnay as a varietal is very much a blank slate and allows the wine maker to put there personal touch on the finished wine. This can be seen through the California over oaking in the late 1980's and early 1990's made famous by Kendall Jackson. Through this research I will counter the argument that White Burgundy was included in the original tasting so why can't Red Burgundy.

#### Business Aspect

In 2017 the Oregon wine industry boomed with total sales worth \$550 million dollars globally up nearly 4% from 2016. This is compared to Red Burgundy, which as of 2007 had an estimated sales of 1.2 billion Euros (\$1,362,000,000.00 US Dollars). As you can see both of these wine regions are established unlike in 1976 when you had a much smaller fine wine market and you had a new wine region challenging the already established French market. I will look at all these markets to show the business landscape was much different in the 1970's and that today's tasting would not be the same if it were put together.

#### Conclusion

It is my hope that through this presentation I can show how far the wine industry has grown into a global market, and that while the Judgment of Paris was a turning point in wine there is no way that you can re-create that even with Burgundy and Pinot Noir. I look forward to attending and presenting as I did in Padua and 2018 in Ithaca.

**File Upload (PDF only)**

- [AAWE-2019-Abstract.pdf](#)

**Privacy**

- Why the Judgment in Paris cannot be replicated today specifically with Burgundy and New World Pinot Noir with a focus on Oregon.
- By using this form you agree with the storage and handling of your data by this website.

Gregory Whitten  
[ghwhitten@gmail.com](mailto:ghwhitten@gmail.com)  
AAWE 2019 Abstract

## **Why the Judgment in Paris cannot be replicated today specifically with Burgundy and New World Pinot Noir with a focus on Oregon.**

### Research Question

Can the Judgment of Paris be replicated with a focus on Burgundy and New World Pinot Noir?

### Key Words

Pinot Noir, Burgundy, Oregon, Limestone, Jory, Business

### Intro and Proposed Research

Recently there has been some speculation as to having another “1976 Judgment in Paris” tasting where you comparing the historical region of Red Burgundy with new world Pinot Noir. This actually was done in the most recent movie SOMM 3, but I will advocate with my research why this is not apples to apples as with California Bordeaux Blends and Bordeaux Cru Classified wines were in the 1976 tasting hosted by Steven Spurrier. Through my research I will look at the historical classification of Burgundy compared to Bordeaux and the differences. I will also use the example of Oregon as the most established Pinot Noir growing region in the new world for the purpose of this presentation. I will compare Oregon, Bordeaux, Napa and Burgundies history and show how different they are and why it would not work in a world-class competition. Then I will look at the scientific soil composition of Burgundies famous “limestone” compared to the “jory” clay of the Willamette Valley to show how different it affects the varietal so that it could not be compared. I will also address why Red Burgundy is different from White Burgundy, which was included in the 1976 tasting from the aspect of the difference of Chardonnay and Pinot Noir. Finally I will look at how the 1976 Judgment in Paris changed the business of wine and helped open a whole new market for wine. I will look at the years following the tasting and the up tick in new world wine market and then compare that too the Willamette Valley market in the last decade to show that there is no need for a tasting like this today.

### Research Method

The main focus of my research will be one of business looking at wine market sales trends in the 1970’s compared to the global market of today. This will overlap with the scientific and historical aspects of Burgundy, Oregon’s Willamette Valley and Napa Valley, which will show that the current business climate backed by science and history shows that you cannot recreate the 1976 Judgment of Paris.

### Burgundy Classifications

To understand why the Judgment of Paris will not be replicated between Burgundy and New World Pinot Noir you have to understand the classification and history of Burgundy. There are currently four modern classifications for Burgundy wine; they are as followed Bourgogne (region wide), Village (44 Village classifications), Premier Cru (641 vineyards) and Grand Cru

(33 vineyards). This system is classified under French law called Appellations d'Origine Contrôlée or AOC for short and Burgundy is composed of 100 AOC's. The law provides strict guidelines for from harvesting to how to treat the vineyards it also provides authentication for the consumer.<sup>1</sup> In production regional wines produce 51.7% of total production, Village 36.8%, Premier Cru's 10.1%, and Grand Cru's 1,4%.<sup>2</sup> The modern day AOC was passed on July 30, 1935.<sup>3</sup>

This was pre-dated in burgundy by many strict regulations set since the roman times, due to the global respect that Burgundian wine has had in history. In 1395 Gamay was outlawed in the vineyards of Phillippe le Hardi. On November 13<sup>th</sup> 1131 Hughes II Duke of Burgundy ceded all of the forest and land around the monastery of St Vivant and that was the beginning of cultivation in Burgundy (today known as the vineyard of Romanee St Vivant). The monk used a sharecropping style system to contract grape growers and wine makers for the order. Some experts think that the use of provenance throughout the pre-modern times where one cuts a healthy vine in half spreads it out and bury the two vines to grow young vines cultivated the Pinot Noir grape for the world in Burgundy.<sup>4</sup> Revolution the regulations were mainly driven by landowners and royalty out of respect. but after the French Revolution it was mainly out of trade. One of the most renowned classifications came from a Burgundian wine trade leader names Andre Julien. He broke burgundy wines into categories to be sold and they went as followed.

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.bourgogne-wines.com/our-wines-our-terroir/decoding-the-aocs/bourgogne-wines-decoding-the-aocs,2467,9263.html?>

<sup>2</sup> The Original Grand Crus of Burgundy. Curtis, Charles MW pg 1-100

<sup>3</sup> [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Appellation\\_d%27origine\\_contr%C3%B4l%C3%A9e](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Appellation_d%27origine_contr%C3%B4l%C3%A9e)

<sup>4</sup> Romanee Conti. Olney, Richard. pg 49-75

- Red Wine Classifications
  - First Class
    - Romanee Conti
    - Chambertin
    - Richebourg
    - Clos Vougeot
    - Romanee-Saint-Vivant
    - La Tache
    - Les Saint-Georges
  - Second Class
    - Corton
    - Vosne
    - Nuits
    - Premeaux
    - Volnay
    - Pommard
    - Beaune
    - Chambolle
    - Morey
    - Savigny-sous-Beaune
    - Meursault
  - Third Class
    - Gevrey
    - Chassagne
    - Aloxe
    - Savigny-sous-Beaune (only ordinary cuvees)
    - Blagny
    - Santenay
    - Chenove

- Fourth Class
  - Mercurey
  - Givry
  - Monthelie
  - Meursault (only ordinary cuvees)
  - Brochon Fixin Fixey
  - Saint-Martin
  - Rully
  - Monbogre
- Fifth Class
  - Montagny, Chenove, Buxy Saint-Vallerin, Saules
  - Jambles |
- White Wine Classifications
  - First Class
    - Puligny
  - Second Class
    - Meursault
  - Third Class
    - Blagny
    - Les Rougeots
  - Fourth Class
    - La Barre
  - Fifth Class
    - Cote de Buxy
    - Bouzeron
    - Givry

From there came Dr. Denis Morelot who meticulously went through each climat in the Cote d'Or and found that at the top and middle of the famous hill the soil was marl and the famous limestone in turn setting the standard for the modern AOC of premier and grand cru vineyard designations. Though the biggest and most influential person who laid the ground work for the detailed and meticulous modern day burgundy AOC was Dr. Jules Lavell his work was the basis for the first modern classification under the Comte d'Agriculture de Beaune (Beaune Agriculture Committee) of 1860. His work was all *Historie et statistique de la vigne et des grand vine de la Cote-d'Or* (History and Statistics of the Vine and the Great Wines of Cote d'Or). In this work he goes into detail about each vineyard in the Cote d'Or and describes the production numbers, soil and also the wines it produces. He broke these wines up into the categories below, which were the predecessor of the current AOC guidelines, though not exact. For example his top classification Tetes de Cuvees are fewer in numbers than the current Grand Cru's. He also adds an extra classification in places for very excellent wines call "vin extra." The Classification are below and I try to align them as close as I can with the current AOC classifications.

- Tetes de Cuvees = Grand Cru
- Premieres Cuvees = Premier Cru
- Deuxiemes Cuvees = Village/Regional
- Troisiemes Cuvees = Village/Regional
  - It is noted by Lavalle that you can group all of these but in particular the Deuxiemes and Troisiemes Cuvees, so that is why I equate them with the current regional and village classification.
- Vin Ordinaire = Classification for the basic Gamay wines.

### Bordeaux Classification

The Bordeaux classification was established per the request of Napoleon at the Exposition Universelle in 1855. The Bordeaux Chamber of commerce took the lead in establishing the class,<sup>5</sup> which is made up of first through fifth growth. There was a revision in 1973, which included Mouton Rothschild into the first growth category. The classification system was very much based on commerce and not where the chateaus are actually situated. This is drastically different than Burgundy, which is based as above on scientific reasoning and taste of each Climat. What this produces is drastically different wines that cannot be put into one category. In my research I plan to dive deeper into how these classifications work, and how the Bordeaux classification sets up better in a head to head competition as with the 1976 Judgment in Paris.

### Oregon Willamette Valley vs. Napa Valley History

Fine wine in the Willamette Valley dates back to between 1965 and 1968 when three UC Davis graduates David Lett, Charles Coury and Dick Erath all separately came to the valley to grow cool climate varietals. Others soon followed they planted Pinot Noir, Riesling, Chardonnay and Pinot Gris. They worked together to try to identify sites that would be ideal for these varietals.<sup>6</sup> As you can see the Willamette Valley and other regions that soon followed in the United States are much younger than Napa Valley where most of the red wines came from in the 1976 Judgment of Paris. The first mission grapes in Napa and Sonoma were planted in the mid 1800's and from there a booming industry was born until prohibition.<sup>7</sup> Though a lot of the wineries in the tasting were up and coming there was a long lineage of growing grapes in Napa and Sonoma giving them a much more established industry to go against Bordeaux in the tasting. I will dive deeper into this topic and point out the difference between the two regions.

### Soil Composition

---

<sup>5</sup> <https://www.bordeaux.com/us/Our-Terroir/Classifications/Grand-Cru-Classes-en-1855>

<sup>6</sup> <https://www.oregonwine.org/discover-oregon-wine/place/willamette-valley/>

<sup>7</sup> <https://www.thewinecellarinsider.com/california-wine/california-wine-history-from-early-plantings-in-1800s-to-today/>

One of the drastic differences is in the soil composition between Burgundy and the Willamette Valley. It is well known that Pinot Noir more than any other grape is very fical (thin skinned) and takes on characters from its terroir. While Bordeaux varietals and Chardonnay tend to be more of a blank slate and allows wine makers to put their personal touch on the finished wine. In Burgundy the soil can drastically change from vineyard to vineyard and that is the difficulty as mentioned before in putting these wines in a head to head category. The two major types are Jurassic Limestone and Marl which is a mix of Clay and Limestone.<sup>8</sup> These soil types are drastically different than the Willamette Valley, which is mainly composed of the famous “Jory” soil, which is the Volcanic Basalt from the Missoula Flood millions of years ago. There is some marine sediment mixed in as well. There is virtually no limestone in the Willamette Valley.<sup>9</sup> This in conjunction to Pinot Noir being affected so much by Terroir produces to different types of wine which I feel you cannot put into competition to get a true verdict of who makes better Pinot Noir, because they are two different types of wine.

### White Burgundy vs. Red Burgundy

The last area I will look at is the difference between White and Red Burgundy since White Burgundy was included in the first Judgment of Paris as the White Wine vs. California Chardonnay. In this section of the presentation I will point out how Chardonnay as a varietal is very much a blank slate and allows the wine maker to put there personal touch on the finished wine. This can be seen through the California over oaking in the late 1980’s and early 1990’s made famous by Kendall Jackson. Through this research I will counter the argument that White Burgundy was included in the original tasting so why can’t Red Burgundy.

### Business Aspect

In 2017 the Oregon wine industry boomed with total sales worth \$550 million dollars globally up nearly 4% from 2016.<sup>10</sup> This is compared to Red Burgundy, which as of 2007 had an estimated sales of 1.2 billion Euros (\$1,362,000,000.00 US Dollars). As you can see both of these wine regions are established unlike in 1976 when you had a much smaller fine wine market and you had a new wine region challenging the already established French market. I will look at all these markets to show the business landscape was much different in the 1970’s and that today’s tasting would not be the same if it were put together.

### Conclusion

It is my hope that through this presentation I can show how far the wine industry has grown into a global market, and that while the Judgment of Paris was a turning point in wine there is no way

---

<sup>8</sup> [http://blog.lastbottlewines.com/learn-wine/burgundy/#The\\_Soils](http://blog.lastbottlewines.com/learn-wine/burgundy/#The_Soils)

<sup>9</sup> Feiring, Alice. The Dirty Guide to Wine. Pg. 63-65.

<sup>10</sup> <https://www.seattletimes.com/business/oregon-wine-industry-sees-economic-boom-in-2017/>

that you can re-create that even with Burgundy and Pinot Noir. I look forward to attending and presenting as I did in 2017 in Padua and 2018 in Ithaca.