

**An Examination of Judge Reliability at a major U.S. Wine Competition
Part 1. Experimental Design, Implementation Details and Interpretation of
Results**

Robert T. Hodgson
Professor emeritus, Humboldt State University
Arcata California
bob@fieldbrookwinery.com

Abstract

An experimental design employing replicate sampling to evaluate the integrity of wine competitions is discussed to answer the question, "why do wines win gold medals at some competitions and fail to place in others?" As well as standard statistical measures, an inconsistency-index is proposed to isolate a particular judge's role in panel incoherence. Analysis-of-variance methods are described and interpreted. Examples of actual judge scores are presented.