Abstract. Recent papers by Hodgson (2008) and Gawel and Godden (2008) have questioned the consistency of expert wine judges in a wine competition setting. In the latter paper, a methodology introduced in psychometric research to measure judge reliability corrected for chance (Cohen, 1968) was used to quantify judge consistency. This paper extends that notion, suggesting a value between 0.5 and 0.7 for Cohen’s weighted kappa (Cohen, 1968) might be used to define an expert wine judge. With that criterion, less than 30% of judges who participated in either of the two studies would be considered “expert.”